James Joyce’s ‘Linguistic Musicality’
A Short Insight into Some Linguistic Musical Patterns in the First Chapter of *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*, and their Echoes in “Sirens”

Arianna Autieri  
(Warwick University, UK)

Abstract The central aim of this paper is to show the similarities of some stylistic features of *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* with musical code. A second purpose is to verify how these musical features are echoed in “Sirens”. In order to initially describe the common properties of language and music and to define how their acoustic and rhythmic similarities are relevant in written texts, the paper will draw on the theories of the Science of Rhythm – a non-academic discipline that influenced many modernist writings, and also studied the common rhythmic features of music and language. After detailing a musical method for the analysis of the linguistic texture of written prose, I focus on the first chapter of *A Portrait*. Hence, I identify the musical characteristics of the novel’s style through a comparison between some Joycean scholars’ theories on music in *A Portrait* and the principles of the Science of Rhythm. Finally, a few examples of the musical language in “Sirens” will provide a benchmark for a comparison with *A Portrait*.

Summary


1 Introduction

The aim of this paper is to propose a rhythmic and acoustic perspective on James Joyce’s prose, with particular reference to some peculiar stylistic features of the first chapter of *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* and their echoes in “Sirens”. My main focus here is Joyce’s ‘linguistic musicality’. Although music has been vastly dealt with in Joycean Studies (eg. Bowen 1995, 1974; Martin 1991 and, more recently, Witen 2018), Joyce’s style has seldom been analysed in musical terms, especially as far as the first works of the author are concerned. In this paper, I propose a small contribution to this field, suggesting a comparison between the language of *A Portrait* and musical code. My theory draws on some findings of the
Science of Rhythm – a non-academic discipline which developed at the end of the 19th century with the specific purpose of studying the composition of rhythm, and which also described some common rhythmic properties of music and language. The connection between Joyce’s works and the Science of Rhythm has been firstly considered by William Martin in *Joyce and the Science of Rhythm* (2012). As Martin proves (2012, 4-13), the Science of Rhythm served to legitimise the stylistic experiments of modernists writers such as Pound, Yeats, and Joyce.\(^1\) Joyce read Herbert Spencer’s *First Principles* (1862) while studying at the University College of Dublin; Martin claims that the chapter “The Rhythm of Motion” was particularly influential in Joyce’s aesthetics, because the word “rhythm” started being used consistently in his theoretical writings ever since. According to Martin, Joyce also knew about Lanier’s theory on the musicality of poetic language through his engagement with Arthur Symons’s treatise on symbolism. Moreover, the principles of Helmholtz’s studies on the properties of sound, upon which the scientific framework of Lanier’s theory depends, are referred to by Bloom throughout the chapter “Sirens” (Martin 2012, 4-13 and 145; Plock 2009).\(^2\)

Before proceeding, I would like to clarify what I mean by ‘linguistic musicality’ and to define how this concept is relevant to my analysis of Joyce’s texts. The term ‘musicality’ has often been used with a metaphorical meaning in relation to literary texts, and it is usually associated with a general lyrical tone in novels or poetry. As Theodor W. Adorno’s affirms (1993, 113), real similarities between the micro-level and the macro-level of verbal code and musical code can be identified. Music and language are initially composed by concrete sounds (notes and words) that are then organised in an ordered form to create a structural meaning (words are organised in sentences, and sentences in paragraphs, while notes are organised in melodic and rhythmical themes that then constitute the musical phrases and sentences). My hypothesis here is that, thanks to the author’s musical ear, poetic language could assume several qualities of the musical compositions, both in its sound patterns and its rhythmical organisation: ‘linguistic musicality’ is hence used in this essay to refer to the acoustic and rhythmical qualities of poetic language that bear some resemblance to music.

\(^1\) Martin affirms: “For the purpose of studying the development of modernist poetry, free verse, and prose, the interaction between the fields of experimental psychology and prosody is of particular interest to the literary critic, as the theories of rhythm developed during this time not only worked to motivate the creation of new poetic forms, but also served to legitimate the stylistic experiments of modernists such as Pound, Yeats, and Joyce” (2012, 2).

\(^2\) As an example, Helmholtz’s theory of harmonics is addressed in “Richie cocked his lips apout. A low incipient note sweet banshee murmured: all. A thrush. A throstle. His breath, birdsweet, good teeth he’s proud of, fluted with plaintive woe. Is lost. Rich sound. Two notes in one there” (*U*, 11: 630-3), where Bloom describes “the simultaneous sounding of Harmonics” (Martin 2012, 148) – “two notes in one"
In Joyce’s texts, the issue of musicality is particularly delicate. It is well known that Joyce was himself a musician. According to his brother Stanislaus Joyce, when writing *Dubliners*, he was “a musical singing... voice (a tenor), a good undeveloped talent in music” (Joyce S., 1958, XIV). Music is particularly relevant in Joyce’s literary aesthetics, and several references to songs and operas have been found in his works. As Timothy Martin affirms in *Joyce in Context* (2009):

Over the years Joyce scholars – most notably Ruth Bauerle, Zack Bowen, Matthew Hodgart and Mabel Worthington – have unearthed a huge number of allusions that reflect Joyce’s lifelong experience of opera, the music hall and pantomime, liturgical music and popular song. (Martin 2009, 278)

According to Martin, music is not only present in the allusions to real song in Joyce’s work, but in several different forms, relating “to its texture, its structure and its ethos or general character” (278). Regarding language, Martin affirms: “certainly, there is a musicality reflected in the tonal and rhythmic qualities of Joyce’s language, in his sound as opposed to his sense” (279). As far as musical language is concerned, not only can a generic musicality be identified in the style and in the rhythmic elements of the texts, but in “Sirens” the writer has set out to explicitly imitate music. This fact has sometimes led to the idea that if readers wish to understand how Joyce used music to shape his language, “Sirens” is the only text to be considered. However, as several scholars have pointed out, Joyce’s own experience as a musician had immediate consequences for all his writings, from *Dubliners* onwards. For example, in his article “Music in *Dubliners*” (1992), Robert Haas claims:

Clearly Joyce in *Dubliners* was already beginning to use language beyond its customary limits; if music could help achieve his expressive purposes, it is reasonable to expect that he might use it too. (Haas 1992, 23)

Similarly, in his essay “The Distant Music of the Spheres”, Thomas Jackson Rice (1999, 216-19) argues that “The Dead” is characterised by the presence of a “verbal music” that derives from some sonic expedients as alliterations and internal rhymes, and peculiar punctuation forms. In this sense, musicality could be identified mostly in the last pages of “The Dead”, which are separated from the rest of the story through a blank space. Take, as an example, the following lines, which are the last lines of *Dubliners*:

---

*Autieri. James Joyce’s ‘Linguistic Musicality’*
His soul swooned slowly as he heard the snow falling faintly through the universe, and faintly falling, like the descent of their last end upon all the living and the dead. (D: 224)\(^3\)

Musicality here is mainly achieved thanks to the use of alliterations, “soul swooned slowly” or “falling faintly”, repeated consonants, s, w, f, internal rhymes and assonances “descENT/END/dEAD”, “slowLY/falLING/faintLY”, and chiasmic figures “fallING faintLY”, “faintLY falling”.\(^4\)

Similarly, discussing *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*, Jack Weaver claims that the text is characterised by the presence of a musical *melos*. This *melos* is defined through Minahan’s words for *Words like a Bell* (1992), as:

> the quality of sound and rhythm... created by... the conscious or intuitive arrangement of various consonant and vowel groupings... and degrees of stressed syllables. (Cited in Weaver 1998, 27)

According to Weaver, this musical *melos* mostly characterises the first chapter of *A Portrait*, and assumes different forms, which will be analysed in the sections below.

For the purposes of this paper, the theory of “primary and secondary rhythms” developed by Sidney Lanier in the field of the Science of Rhythm might be particularly significant, since it allows a comparison to be drawn between the real acoustic properties of language and of music, and provides a framework for a musical analysis of Joyce’s language. While in *Joyce and the Science of Rhythm* (2012) William Martin investigates “the impact of rhythmic science on Joyce’s critical and creative writings” (Martin 2012, 27), suggesting a simultaneous three levels analysis of the texts focused on “the study of (1) discourse, (2) influence, and (3) stylistics” (27), my purpose here is to apply Lanier’s rhythmical principles, as presented in *The Science of English Verse*, to a mere stylistic analysis of *A Portrait* in order identify the concrete similarities between language and music in Joyce’s prose.

---

3 In the example and in the whole essay, bold is used to indicate a remarkable vowel and consonant texture; capital letters indicate rhymes, assonances and consonances; and slashes indicate intonation units.

4 As we will later see in this essay, many of these expedients cause a concrete musicality, and bear upon the parameter of timbre.
2 Lanier and the Science of Rhythm

Lanier’s *The Science of English Verse* (1880) proposes a new contribution “towards a complete theory of the technic of English verse” (Lanier 1880, xv) through a musical analysis of the expedients used in poetry. In his study, the similarities between poetical language and music are identified through a comparison of the common acoustic qualities of their sonic material. Even though Lanier’s work is mainly focused on the description of poetry, the rhythmical principles individuated could be considered relevant also in prose, as Lanier himself affirms: “It would not serve to discriminate verse and prose. Prose has its rhythms, its tunes, and its tone-colors, like verse” (Lanier 1880, 57).

In order to identify the musical features of poetry, Lanier investigates how the perception of read aloud language is characterised by rhythmic principles similar to those perceived in music. According to Lanier (50), since words are sounds produced by a “reed-instrument which can alter the shape of its tube (the buccal cavity) at pleasure”, their sonic material could be compared to the sonic material of music:

‘Words’ means simply one kind of musical sounds, and ‘musical sounds’ means simply another kind. (Lanier 1880, 50)

The hypothesis of Lanier’s theory (1880, 22) is that the acoustic perception also takes place during silent reading:

The science of verse, then, observes and classifies all the phenomena of rhythm, of tune, and of tone-colour, so far as they can be exhibited to the ear directly by spoken words, or to the ear, through the eye, by written or printed signs of spoken words. (1880, 58)

Several later studies on ‘auditory imagery’ have confirmed Lanier’s hypothesis, explaining how the duration, pitch and timbre perceived when reading silently maintain their acoustic qualities, thanks to the activation of the auditory cortex while decoding verbal meanings (e.g. Hubbard 2010; Perrone-Bertolotti et al. 2012).

To formulate his theory, Lanier initially draws on the concept of “compound rhythm” by Herbert Spencer:

Rhythm is very generally not simple but compound. There are usually at work various forces, causing undulations differing in rapidity; and hence it continually happens that besides the primary rhythms there are secondary rhythms, produced by the periodic coincidence and antagonism of the primary ones. Double, triple, and even quadruple rhythms, are thus generated. (Spencer [1862] 2009, 316)
According to Lanier, in poetry as well as in music, rhythm is given by an initial “primary rhythm” which is subsequently organised by other “secondary rhythms”. As Martin points out (2012, 124), there are several passages in *A Portrait* that prove Joyce’s familiarity with this theory. As an example, Stephen appears to distinguish between primary and secondary rhythms when listening to the sound of the train track during the journey to Cork with his father. Stephen in fact composes a prayer which ended in a trail of foolish words which he made to fit to the insistent rhythm of the train; and silently, at intervals of four seconds, the telegraph poles held the galloping notes of the music between punctual bars. (*P*, 73)

According to Martin (2012, 124-5) the intuition of a primary rhythmic form precedes the composition of the poem, and “the choice of diction (and its order) is predetermined by the perception of the metrical pattern”.

The theory of composed rhythm is particularly useful in order to understand the similarities between rhythmical patterns of music and poetry. Lanier argues that a primary rhythm is perceived whenever a sequence of sounds and silences is present. In order to understand this sequence of sounds, the mind needs to organise them in patterns; the organisation is carried out with reference to the four parameters of sound, duration, intensity, pitch and timbre (or colour):

1. How long a sound lasts (duration);  
2. How loud a sound is (intensity);  
3. How shrill that is, how high, as to bass or treble a sound is (pitch);  
4. Of what sounds a given sound is composed […] (tone-color).  

(Lanier 1880, 24)

The result of this organisation is a perceived secondary rhythm of the same sonic material.

In order to illustrate his theory, Lanier proposes the following examples, which are meant to show the primary rhythm and its organisation in secondary rhythms, and which are particularly useful in understanding how Lanier’s theory could be applied to a stylistic analysis of Joyce’s texts. In the picture below, primary rhythm is composed of a sequence of eight sounds, each followed by a silence:

---

5 As far as tone-colour (or timbre) is concerned, it is important to underline that a peculiar timbre is perceived thanks to the harmonics emitted when a sound is played, both in music and in language.
The initial sequence can be grouped according to the duration of each sound or the duration of the silences,

the ear [...] may again coordinate the same sounds with secondary reference to their duration in order to divide them into groups of two or more units; each group being distinguished by some variation in the duration of either of its sounds, or in the duration of the silences between them (Lanier 1880, 43)

which musically could be written as:\(^7\)

The sequence can be grouped also according to the pitch of the sounds,

their colour (timbre),

The illustration as to the eye readily suggests that the eight notes might be grouped for the sense of sight by making every second, third, etc., note of a certain color, say red, while the other note or notes of each group were blue. (Lanier 1880, 46)

---

6 The example refers to the musical notation in a mere graphical sense.
7 We should note that this example was used by Lanier to explain how intensity works in secondary rhythm using two different blacks (one more intense than the other). However, as the musicians among the readers can possibly notice, the example proposed suits better the first definition of duration. I will provide an example designed following Lanier’s description of intensity later on in this essay.
which we can graphically represent as

![Figure 4](image)

**Figure 4. Graphic representation of the rhythmic organisation of eight sounds according to their colour**

In real acoustic perception, the sounds can also be grouped according to their intensity (i.e. their volume),

Suppose, for example, the first be printed in ink of an intenser black than the second, and this variation be consistently carried on through the eight, (Lanier 1880, 43)

which we can illustrate as:

![Figure 5](image)

**Figure 5. Graphic representation of the rhythmic organisation of eight sounds according to their intensity**

As far as intensity is concerned, Lanier explains that in written texts this parameter does not play the same distinguishing role that it plays in real hearing. The minor role of intensity in the perception of written sounds is confirmed also by Hubbard’s studies on auditory imagery (Hubbard 2010, 304-5).

In order to provide a further explanation of his theory, Lanier also proposes an acoustic example, and describes how the hearers perceive the regular sequence of the sounds of the clock (primary rhythm) as if they were divided in groups of two (secondary rhythm):

[we perceive] a difference in pitch, as if the clock, instead of saying, “Tick-tick, tick-tick, tick-tick,” and so on, should say, “Tick-tack, tick-tack, tick-tack,” and so on [...] but also a difference in emphasis, stress, or accent (that is, in intensity), as if the clock said “Tick-táck, tick-táck,” and so on. (Lanier 1880, 63-4)
As Martin points out, this example was significant also in Joyce’s aesthetics:

It is clear that Joyce associated the perception of the primary rhythm with the ticking of a clock, for the third section of the novel depicts a “Fire Sermon” in which Father Arnall constructs a rhetorical conceit that links the opposition between heaven and hell to the alternation between the ‘tick’ and the ‘tock’ of a great clock. (Martin 2012, 126)

Following Lanier’s theory, we can state that a musical composer can influence the perceived rhythm of the composition by melodic, durational and timbral expedients that organise the primary rhythm (a sequence of notes and silences) – hence determining a pre-organised secondary rhythm. By recurring to long and short notes, to the repetition of phrases (musical sentences), as well as by dividing the composition in sections, the composer influences the rhythmic duration of the musical text. Similarly, melodic patterns of notes influence the secondary rhythm according to the parameter of pitch, and a different set of musical instruments, or effects on the same instrument, influence the rhythm according to the parameter of timbre. Finally, recurring to musical dynamics (forte, piano, crescendo), the composer influences the rhythm according to the parameter of intensity.

Although in the rhythmic organisation of language the meaning is also to be considered, the writer can use several poetic devices to organise the verbal material of poetry and prose. According to Lanier, primary rhythm in the English language is given by “verse sounds” (1880, 97), small sonic units that are represented by words and silences. Metrical expedients and the organisation of the poem in verses and stanzas (in poetry), or, we can infer, the organisation of the prose text in phrases, sentences, and paragraphs (achieved also thanks to punctuation), as well as the recurrence of words and sentences, influence the secondary rhythm according to the parameter of duration. Intonation units and prosodic elements are signalled through the punctuation, which can be used in peculiar ways to modify the pitch of the text. The intonation or pitch of the text is also modified through emphatic groups – such as an unusual word order, or peculiar word plays which condition the stresses of the sentences. Finally, because each vowel and consonant have their peculiar timbre, devices such as alliterations, rhymes, assonances and consonances, or a remarkable vowel

---

8 Spoken language is characterised by prosodic units, called “intonation units”, with one or more picks of intonation. Each of them is characterised by a peculiar melodic movement in its final part, and they are separated by pauses (Lanier 1880; Chafe 1988; Knowles 1987).

9 As reported in Anatomy and Physiology for Speech, Language and Hearing (2010), “Pitch and intensity play a significant role in the suprasegmental aspects of communication” (Seikel et al., 2010, 254).
and consonant texture have a bearing on the timbre of the text. This latter statement might need some more explanation. In fact, although it is commonly thought that vowel and consonants have different pitches, because the pronunciation of linguistic sounds depends on the physical shape of the vocal cavity, phonemes are characterised by different timbres and not different pitches. On this topic, Lanier writes:

> Every vowel-sound, every consonant, every combination of letters in a syllable, every shade of pronunciation, is simply a difference of tone-color made by the almost instantaneous changes which the muscles of the mouth and throat can effect in the shape of the buccal cavity. (Lanier 1880, 52)

The connection between phonemes and timbre has been confirmed in later studies; for instance, in *Pitch and Timbre: Definition, Meaning and Use* (1997), Houtsma writes:

> The timbre, although not commonly named this way in speech literature, is different for each phoneme and depends physically on the shape of the glottal air flow pulse and the instantaneous shape and length of the vocal tract (throat, oral and nasal cavities). (Houtsma 1997, 110)

Drawing on Lanier’s theory, I will now show how it could be useful to define musicality in the first chapter of *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man* and to compare it with “Sirens”.

### 3 ‘Linguistic Musicality’ in the First Chapter of *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*

Although references to music and rhythmic patterns could be found in the whole *Portrait*, as Jack Weaver points out, it is in the first chapter of the novel that musical language is particularly significant (1998, 27). In the first pages of *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*, the acoustic dimension of the language and its poetical qualities are used to show Stephen’s artistic potentialities. Weaver notes this as follows:

> Stephen’s focus upon the sounds and meanings of words combines music and rhetoric and suggests he has a future in the arts. (1998, 29)

---

10 For instance, in his study, William Martin refers to vowels and consonants as if they were different in term of pitch: “the ‘bright’ timbre of the Sirens’ voices can be reflected by the choice of vowel sounds with a high pitch (i/e)” (2012, 152).
Through what Kershner defines “pseudo-stream-of-consciousness” (Kershner 1986, 885) and the free indirect discourse, Stephen’s awareness of the properties of the language is mirrored in a narrative style in which sounds play a significant role and can thus be considered ‘musical’. In order to describe the musicality in the first chapter of A Portrait, I will initially make reference to the definition of melos given by Weaver in Joyce’s Music and Noise (1998). Weaver describes three forms of melos in A Portrait: the lullabies and the ‘baby talk’ of little Stephen, Stephen’s concern with the meaning and the sound of words, and, finally, theme and variation forms - id est repetitions of sentences, ‘augmented’ or ‘diminished’ with more words or less words when repeated. In order to make some comparisons with “Sirens”, I will focus on two modalities of melos: namely Stephen’s concern with words, and the theme and variation forms.

Stephen is interested in the relationship between the meaning and the signifier of words. Therefore, he reflects on words which imitate real sounds, such as “suck” (P: 9), on words with different meanings, such as “belt” (P: 7), on the meaning of his name or on the relationship between the word “God” and the meaning of “God” in different languages. Stephen’s attention to words often results in their repetition throughout the whole chapter. As we have seen considering Lanier’s theory, these periodical repetitions mainly influence the secondary rhythm according to the parameter of duration. However, Stephen’s interest for the sonic material of the words sometimes results also in the use of timbrical expedients such as a peculiar consonants and vowels texture, alliterations, imitative phonemes and internal rhymes.

If we consider the following passage from A Portrait,

1 It made a roar like a train at night. And when he closed the flaps/ the roar was shut off/ like a train going into a tunnel./ That night at Dalkey the train had roared like that/ and then, when it went into the tunnel,/ the roar stopped. He closed his eyes/ and the train went on,/ roaring/ and then stopping:/ roaring again,/ stopping. It was nice to hear it roar/ and stop/ and then roar out of the tunnel again/ and then stop. (P: 11)

we can notice that the most used rhythmic expedient is the repetition of words - “roar”, “stop”, “train”, “tunnel”, “then”, “again”, “going in/out”. Timbrical expedients are also used: there are internal rhymes - like “agAIN /thEN”, “nOISE/bOYS” - and phonemes that imitate real sounds - such as the occlusive t and p in “stop”, which could imitate the dampened sound of the train in the gallery, or the liquid r that allows the sound to expand as the noise of a train out of the tunnel or of the refectory. In this example, punctuation, which influences both the duration and the intonation of the text, is used to distinguish the sentences in such a peculiar way that the
reader can perceive how the rhythmic motion of the phrases mirrors the motion of the train.

Similarly, in the following passage,

2 First came the vacation/ and then the next term/ and then vacation again/ and then another term/ and then again the vacation. It was like a train going in and out of tunnels/ and that was like the noise/ of the boys/ eating in the refectory/ when you opened and closed the flaps of the ears./ Term./ vacation./ tunnel./ out./ noise./ stop./ How far away it was! (P: 14),

the rhythmical recurrence of the words “then”, “again”, “term”, “vacation” is the most used musical device. The passage is musically similar to example 1. The alternation between “term” and “vacation”, in particular, resembles the alternation between the verbs “roar” and “stop”, and the same rhythmical words “then” and “again” are also used. Timbre effects – rhymes, “then/again” (or “noise/boys, as in the preceding example), and assonances, “next/term” – are present too. Intonation units, although not signalled by punctuation, similarly reflect a recurring movement, like the one of the train. However, a new musical device is introduced: in “Term, vacation; tunnel, out; noise, stop” we can notice an unusually excessive presence of commas and semicolons, which determines the perception of short intonation units.

Martin also refers to this last example in his analysis of Joyce’s writings. Although Martin draws on the rhythmic principles of the Science of Rhythm too, his analysis mainly focuses on the poetic significance of the rhythmical patterns identified in the text. In fact, he suggests that when presenting the rhythmic experiences of Stephen, Joyce “reveals the ‘tension’ that motivates the biographical development of the hero”, since Stephen’s personality is “‘stretched’ between music of the maternal sphere (the metrical rhythm) and the intellectual image of the paternal sphere (the structural rhythm)” (Martin 2012, 30). The maternal and paternal spheres are physically separated, then, as the former is connected to home and the latter to the boarding school at Clongowes Wood. In Martin’s view, the train journey from Bray to Clongowes Wood provides Stephen with an experience of continuous movement. Although Stephen is at school in the above example, “the memory of the train journey allows him to simulate the alternation between home and school, creating a continuous rhythm that dramatizes the structural rhythm as the opposition between two poetic symbols” (119). In example 2, Martin therefore identifies “three rhythms with different periods of recurrence”: he argues that “term” and

11 Repeated words and phrases are underlined.
“vacation” are two spatially and temporally separated periods, and “noise” and “silence” (“open” and “closed ears”) represent a continuous rhythm controlled by the movements of the body. For Martin, since the alternating noise and silence of the boys in the refectory is similar to that of the train, the “continuous rhythm allows one form of experience to be transformed into another” (119), resulting in a symbolic correspondence between “term” and “noise”, and “vacation” and “silence”. As we have seen, the rhythmical periods identified by Martin play a significant role in the ‘linguistic musicality’ of the text. In fact, these words also influence the rhythmical duration of example 2, together with other words already used in example 1, like “again” and “then”, and their alternation is significant also as far as the intonation of the text is concerned. When the two examples are analysed together, the connections between “term” and “noise”, “vacation” and “silence” could also be considered as the result of a musical linking between the two passages. In example 1 the noise and silence of the refectory is represented by the words “roar” and “stop”. These words are then changed in example 2 – the first with “term” and the second with “vacation” – in order to reproduce a similar rhythmical effect. The association between noise and “term” and silence and “vacation” is thus also inferred due to the position of the musical patterns in the rhythmic structure of the sentences.

Returning to Weaver’s musical definitions, the other form of melos considered here is theme and variations. According to Weaver, this form of melos consists in larger rhythmic patterns (more than a phrase) that recur throughout the first chapter of A Portrait with some minor variations, as the following examples show:

3.1 That was mean of Wells to shoulder him into the square ditch/ because he would not swOP/ his little snuffbOX/ for Wells’s seasoned hacking chestnUT/ the conqueror of forty/ How cold and slimy the water had been!/ A fellow had once seen a big rAt jUMP/ into the scUM/ (P: 8)

3.2 It was Wells who had shouldered him into the square ditch the day before/ because he would not swOP/ his little snuffbOX/ for Wells’s seasoned hacking chestnUT/ the conqueror of forty/ It was a mean thing to do/ all the fellows said it was. And how cold and slimy the water had been! And a fellow had once seen a big rAt jUMP/ pIOp/ into the scUM. The cold slime of the ditch covered his whole body. (P: 11)

The effect of theme and variations is achieved here through phrases and sentences that are repeated in a variated form – augmented or diminished with more or less words. Similarly, in music, an original theme is developed in different variations, usually thanks to some changes in the duration of the rhythmical patterns, or the addition or subtraction of some
notes; the theme could also become less and less recognisable each time it is repeated. In this case, the first (and in this case only) variation of the original theme, as in music, is similar to the original theme. Only a few words are added, “it was a mean thing to do; all the fellows said it was” or “and” and “plop”, and “that was mean of Wells” is changed in “it was wells who”. Theme and variations thus influence the secondary rhythm of the text according to the parameter of duration, since sentences and phrases repetitions recur in time, resulting in a rhythmical period. The recurrence of the passage about Wells has a strong rhythmical effect that could be perceived by the reader as the main musical expedient. As in the examples above, however, other linguistic expedients influence the rhythm of the sentences. Among the timbre devices that Joyce employs, there are alliterations, “was Wells who”, internal assonances, such as “swOP” “snuffbOX” (“ChestnUT”), and phono-symbolic consonants (s l m in “slime”).

Word repetitions and themes and variations are significant also from a melodic point of view. As Richard Kershner affirms in The Artist as Text: Dialogism and Incremental Repetition in Joyce’s Portrait (1986, 885), repetitions in the first chapter of A Portrait are usually typical of Stephen’s schoolmates’ jargon, of the adults’ language, or represent mysterious signifiers. Words and sentences are repeated in the main narrative mainly because of their sound, or because Stephen is trying to master their meaning. Quoting is a typical feature of Stephen’s mind, hence also Stephen’s own words are sometimes subject to a similar repetition process, and especially when they result in “poetical compositions” – as in the above examples (3.1-3.2) mentioned by Weaver and also by Kershner (1986, 886). In order to assess the significance of these recurring words and sentences repetitions, Kershner draws on Bakhtin’s theory of “intonational quotation marks”. According to Bakhtin (1981, 50), “indirect discourse […] the representation of another’s word, another’s language” is reported in intonational quotation marks. Intonational quotations are a form of “intentional hybrid” (Bakhtin 1981, 76). Although grammatically belonging to only one speaker, hybrid sentences are composed by two voices – “two utterances, two speech manners, two styles, two ‘languages’” (Bakhtin 1981, 305). Bakhtin’s definition is useful to understand how repetitions could be musically influential in determining the pitch of the text. Normal melodic movements in the sentences of texts may be in fact modified by the presence of different voices in the narrator’s discourse, because these repetitions are characterised by a different intonation with respect to the main narrative. An example of how intonational quotation marks determine the intonation of Joyce’s text is provided by the following lines:

4 Was that a sin for Father Arnall /to be in a wax/ or was he allowed /to get into a wax/ when the boys were idle because that made them
study better or was he only letting on/ to be in a wax? (P: 40) (Kershner 1986, 884)\textsuperscript{12}

In this passage, the lack of punctuation makes it difficult for the reader to understand the intonation units of the text and to mentally pronounce the sentence. However, the rhythmical recurrence of another voice in the text assists the reader in distinguishing the curves of intonation: “to be/ get in a wax” is mentally pronounced with a different voice and pitch with respect to the main narrative, because it is connected to the jargon of Father Arnall; it divides the prosody of the sentence in melodic \textit{units}, as the slashes in the passage show.

4 \textbf{Echoes of A Portrait in the Music of “Sirens”: “Verbal Music”}

As I have shown, a ‘linguistic musicality’ is identifiable in the first chapter of \textit{A Portrait}, although musicality is not explicitly declared as the writing technique of the book. Instead, as Joyce himself affirms in a conversation with George Borach in June 1919 and later that year in a letter to Harriet Weaver (Ellmann 1982, 459-62), the imitation of music is precisely the stylistic \textit{skopos} of “Sirens”. According to Bowen (1995, 28) linguistic musicality in “Sirens” is achieved in two ways: through a musical language (poetical devices, such as alliteration, rhymes and onomatopoeia) and through the verbal imitation of actual musical techniques, such as \textit{staccato} or \textit{sostenuto}. Although several critics have described the musical techniques imitated in the chapter, generic musical language has been less considered. Among the scholars who have attempted to describe how Joyce exploits the properties of the language in a musical way in the 11th episode of \textit{Ulysses}, Andreas Fischer (1999, 256-7) identifies a generic linguistic musicality in the episode, described as “verbal music”. It is interesting to note that several aspects of the highly musical linguistic texture of the examples provided by Fischer and reported below bear some similarities with the musical \textit{melos} identified in \textit{A Portrait}.

1.1 \textbf{Bald Pat} at a sign drew nigh. A \textbf{pen} and \textbf{ink}. He \textbf{went}. A \textbf{pad}. He \textbf{went}. A \textbf{pad} to \textbf{blot}. He \textbf{heard}, \textbf{deaf Pat}. (\textit{U, 11: 822-3})

1.2 \textbf{Bald deaf Pat} brought \textbf{quite} flat \textbf{pad} \textbf{ink}. \textbf{Pat} set with ink \textbf{pen} quite flat \textbf{pad}. \textbf{Pat} took \textbf{plate dish knife fork}. \textbf{Pat} went. (\textit{U, 11: 847-8})

2.1 Bloom signed to \textbf{Pat},// \textbf{bald Pat} is a \textbf{waiter hard of hearing},// to set

\textsuperscript{12} Kershner uses italics to indicate the intonation quotation marks.
Firstly, in each sentence it is possible to identify the first of the forms of melos analysed earlier: a peculiar concern with words. The narrator’s interest in the meaning and the sound of the words results in a highly musical discourse, in which many of the rhythmical expedients signalled by Lanier can be identified. Primary rhythm is mainly characterised by monosyllables, while the many repetitions of words and of phrases create a secondary rhythm, – “Pat”, “waiter”, “went”, “pad” “hard” “hear” “the door of the bar”, “while you wait” – variated repetitions of words – “waiter, waited, waiting” – and of phrases and sentences – “He waits while you wait”, “He waits while you wait”, “While you wait if you wait he will wait while you wait”, “Wait while you wait”, “Hee hee hee hee”. These patterns recur periodically in different paragraphs influencing the rhythmic duration of the text. There are also several timbre expedients, as in A Portrait: alliterations – “wait while you wait/ went”, “hard of his hearing” –, an internal rhyme – “ajar”, “bAR” –, a wordplay between “he” and the laughter “hee hee”. Some vowel transformations are also used: the timbre effect of “wait/ while/ wait/ will” is similar to that of the famous phrase “pick, pack, pock, puck” (P: 35) from A Portrait, which imitates the sound produced by the cricket bats. Consonant repetitions play a remarkable timbre role: an example is the repetition of the stops p, b, t, d e k in “Bald deaf Pat brought quite flat pad ink/ Pat set with ink pen quite flat pad”, which significantly influence the colour of the passage. Interestingly, as we will later see, the repetition of stop consonants is also linked to the musical technique of martellato.

Secondly, these examples from “Sirens” are also partly linked together like the sentences about “Wells” in A Portrait (P: 8; P: 11), meaning that they could be associated with the other form of melos described by Weaver – theme and variations. In this case, however, the themes are much more rephrased when variated than Well’s sentences are. In the two first examples, for instance, the “pen ink and pad” are firstly asked and then taken to Bloom. In 1.2 the cluster of words is initially repeated, though in a different order, “pad ink […] ink pen quite flat pad”, and then substituted by “plate dish knife fork”. Similarly, the phrases “Bald Pat” is variated in “Bald deaf Pad” and the sentence “He went” is changed in “Pat went”. 
In the two second instances, the variated phrases, “hard of hearing” and “waiter, waited, waiting” from 2.1 become “hard of hear” (in the same passage) and “hard of his hearing” (in 2.2), and “waiter who waits while you wait”, which is repeated and changed several times in 2.2.

If, as I have shown in example 2.2, a different voice or a different thought seems to repeatedly interrupt the narrative, “hee hee hee hee” – as intonation quotation marks interrupted the narrative of A Portrait – then the examples themselves represent a different voice inside the narrative of “Sirens”, fitting in with the structure of the fugue that Joyce aims to recreate in the chapter. Similarly, if ‘quoting’ is a typical procedure of Stephen’s mind and quotations of previous thoughts influence the intonation and the duration of the first chapter of A Portrait, this happens even more with Bloom’s mind, whose creations generate rhythmical patterns throughout the whole of Ulysses, and with the narrating voice. In this sense, the examples of “verbal music” identified by Fischer could be considered part of a recurrent theme in “Sirens” – namely the theme of the deaf waiter Pat. Although the examples provided by Fischer are among the most musical, we can notice that many of the passages in which Pat is described are in fact characterised by a “verbal music”, and they are related to each other in a musical way.

Some further examples include:

3.1 To the door of the bar and diningroom came bald Pat./ came bothered Pat./ came Pat./ waiter of Ormond”. (U, 11: 286-8)

3.2 Pat paid for diner’s popped bottle:/ and over tumbler, /tray and popped bottle ere he went he whispered, /bald and bothered, / with miss Douce. (U, 11: 317-19)

3.3 Wait./ wait./ Pat./ waiter/ waited. (U, 11: 393)

3.4 Bald Pat, bothered waiter, waited for drink orders. (U, 11: 444)

3.5 Here, Pat, return. Come. He came, he came, he did not stay. (U, 11: 994)

3.6 Deaf, bothered. But perhaps he has wife and family waiting, / waiting Patty come home./ Hee hee hee hee./ Deaf wait while they wait. (U, 11: 1113-15)

As we can notice, the two form of melos described in A Portrait are similarly important in these examples. There are recurring sounding words associated to “Pat” – “bothered”, “bald”, “deaf”, “wait” in all its possible forms, and “came” –, which are alternatively present when Pat is mentioned.
Among timbre effects, there are alliterations, “Pat paid”, “wait while”, the repeated consonants p, b, t (martellato consonants) and internal rhymes, “cAME/cAME/stAY”. As in the examples analysed above, word clusters are also repeated – “he came”, “popcorked bottle” – and variated – “came bald Pat/, came bothered Pat, /came Pat”. A frequent phrase in the lines that Fischer analyses – “waits while you wait” – is variated here in “wait while THEY wait”. An instance of the laughter used in the examples above is also present: “waiting Patty come home./ Hee hee hee hee./ Deaf wait while they wait”. Considering all the possible associations of words, Pat’s theme recurs in its variations throughout almost the entire episode.

Interestingly, some other examples of what Fischer defines as “verbal music” can be found in the sentences related to the appearance of the blind piano tuner, towards the end of the episode. The blind man’s arrival is introduced by the sound of his cane “Tap”, which interrupts the main narrative more and more often since verse 933, until the young man makes his appearance in the streets and in the Ormond. Since the appearance of the piano tuner’s musical theme (U, 11: 1190), Pat’s one disappears. The sentences describing the blind man – represented by the sound “tap”, which can be read back to front as “Pat” – could be considered a final variation of deaf Pat’s music, in which the theme of not seeing is opposed to the theme of not hearing. The blind man’s gestures are described by a musical narrating voice as:

4.1 Tap blind walked tapping by the tap the curbsone tapping, / tap by tap. (U, 11: 1190)

4.2 Tap. Tap. A stripling, / blind, / with a tapping CAne CAme taptaptapping [by Daly’s window where a mermaid hair all streaming (but he couldn’t see) blew whiffs of a mermaid (blind couldn’t), mermaid, / coolest whiff of all] (U, 11: 1234-6)

4.3 Tip. An unseeing stripling stood in the door. /He saw not bronze. He saw not gold. Nor Ben nor Bob nor Tom nor Si nor George nor tanks nor Richie nor Pat./ Hee hee hee hee./ He did not see. (U, 11: 1281-3)

We can notice that the first form of melos, attention to words, is mostly heard in examples 4.1 and in the first line of example 4.2, where rhythmical patterns are given by timbre devices, like the insistence on the stops t, p, b – the same used in Pat’s theme – “CAne/CAme”, and, mostly, the continual repetition of varied forms of the word “tap”. In example 4.3, the repeated conjunction “nor” influences the parameter of duration in the secondary rhythm of the text, and some timbre devices are also present – such as the alliteration “un-seeing stripling stood”, and the repeated consonant h. As far as the theme and variations form of melos is concerned, it can be
seen that in example 4.2 the first line is a varied occurrence of example 4.1. The second part, instead, is a variation of some lines from the beginning of the episode:

Two sheets cream vellum paper [...] in Daly’s Henry Flower bought [...] Wise Bloom eyed on the door a poster, a swaying mermaid smoking midst nice waves. Smoke mermaids, coolest whiff of all. (U, 11: 295-301)

Similarly, the laughter from Pat’s theme – “hee hee hee hee” – returns in example 4.3. Finally, some words and phrases introduced in example 4.2 – “stripling”, “he could not see” – become the source of a different music in example 4.3: “An unseeing stripling stood”, “/He saw not bronze./He saw not gold/He did not see.”

A final comment on the connections of the generic linguistic musicality in “Sirens” concerns some specific musical punctuation devices used in the 11th episode of Ulysses. Discussing this topic, Fischer (1999, 225) underlines that Joyce uses punctuation in two rhythmical ways in “Sirens”: through underpunctuation, the lack of punctuation, and through overpunctuation, the excessive use of punctuation marks. Both these expedients are not meant to signal units of meaning, as punctuation usually does in written texts. Rather, they re-organise the sentences only according to their form in order to create rhythmical effects: in this sense they have a bearing upon the mere signifier, as the rhythmical expedients used in music do. Both over and under punctuation were already used in A Portrait – for instance in the lines “Term, vacation; tunnel, out; noise, stop” (P: 14), and in the example about Father Arnall (P: 40), discussed above – and create a similar musical effect in the text. The following two examples show how overpunctuation and underpunctuation are used in Ulysses in a musical way:

5 Miss Douce halfstood to see her skin askance in the barmirror gilded lettered where hock and claret glasses shimmered and in their midst a shell (U, 11: 118-20)

6 Will?/You?/I./Want./You./To. (U, 11: 1096) (Fischer 1999, 255)

In example 6 the melodic curves of a naturally punctuated “Will you?/ I want you to/” are interrupted by an excessive use of full stops and question marks, “Will?/You?/I./Want./You./To”. The melody reproduced in the line is hence independent from its meaning, because the units of sense are segmented: there are short curves of intonations that are limited to single words, while the whole sentence is not characterized by its peculiar intonation patterns. Similarly, the opposite absence of punctuation marks to indicate the sense units in example 5 makes it necessary for the reader
either to mentally pronounce the sentence without pauses and melodic differences, or to look for other intonation expedients in the text to understand the patterns of sense. As with “to be/get in a wax” in A Portrait, in this case some other expedients may also help the reader identify the intonation units. For instance, the wordplay “skin askance”, the compound words “barmirror” and “gilderlettered”, or the rhyme “gilderletterED/shimmerED”, as well as the emphatic position of “in their midst” in the sentence may be considered an aid for understanding the melodic distinctions, because they could be pronounced with a different speed and voice with respect to the main narrative. With recourse to these, the reader could mentally pronounce the example as:

Miss Douce halfstood to see her skin askance/ in the barmirror gildedletterED/ where hock and claret glasses shimmerED/ and/ in their midst/ a shell (U, 11: 118-120)13

4.1 Echoes of A Portrait in the Music of “Sirens”: staccato and martellato

In this last section, I consider some musical techniques that Joycean scholars have identified in “Sirens”. In particular, I will focus on the linguistic imitation of staccato and martellato, as they could be linked to the musical expedients identified in A Portrait. In music, staccato is a form of articulation through which notes of shortened duration are separated from the notes that may follow by silence. In “Sirens” Joyce achieves a staccato effect though the use of overpunctuation, and by shortening words. Unlike in music itself, in which staccato influences only the duration of the notes, in language, the prosody of the phrases is also affected, because, as seen above, the melodic curves of overpunctuated sentences are not the same of those of sentences punctuated according to their meaning. Bowen identifies staccato in the following example (1995, 28) of “Sirens”:

1 Miss Douce, Miss Lydia, did not believe: Miss Kennedy, Mina, did not believe: George Lidwell, no: Miss Dou did not: the first, the first: gent with the tank: believe, no, no: did not, Miss Kenn: Lidlydiawell: the tank. (U, 11: 818-20)

The words “Miss Douce”, “Gentleman”, “Miss Kennedy” and “tankard”, and the phrase “did not believe” are abbreviated in “Miss Dou” “Gent”, “Miss Kenn”, “tank” and “did not”, and the musical pauses are recreated through the use of the asyndeton. In these lines, the curves of intonation

13 Emphatic groups are signalled in italics.
are short, and they end after each comma or colon. The example used above to define *overpunctuation* – “Will?/ You?/ I./ Want./ You./ To” (*U*, 11: 1096) – is also considered by critics (e.g. Gilbert 1963, 223) as an occurrence of *staccato*, even though in this case words are not shortened, and *staccato* is achieved only through punctuation. As seen before, this example is also similar to the one analysed in the previous sections – “Term, vacation; tunnel, out; noise, stop” (*P*: 14). Although the use of excessive punctuation marks in *A Portrait* are possibly a consequence of Stephen’s experimentations with language, the telegraphic style resulting from this attempt could also be seen as a first effort to reach what Declan Kiberd (2000, 968) defines “staccato style”, a narrative technique which will be used not only as a musical expedient in the 11th episode, but also as a narrating device in the whole *Ulysses*, and which is peculiar to Bloom’s interior monologue.

The second musical technique considered here, *martellato*, is a music timbre device used mostly in bow instruments and obtained by holding the bow against the string with pressure, then releasing it explosively to produce a sharp, biting attack. It is sometimes required together with *staccato*. In “Sirens”, Joyce appears to rely on the modality of articulation of the stops consonants, in which sound is explosively released after the blockage of the vocal tract is removed, to imitate *martellato*. An example is:

One rapped on a door, one tapped with a knock, did he knock Paul de Kock, with a loud proud knocker, with a cock carracarracarra cock. Cockcock. (*U*, 11: 986-8)

In these lines, the most used consonants are *c/k* – “knock” “Kock” “cock” “carracarra” – although also other stops are used (mostly *p* and *d*). *Martellato* is imitated also in the examples of “verbal music” in “Sirens” considered above, as part both of Pat’s and the piano tuner’s themes, in which *p*, *b* and *t* were frequently used. In all the examples, the stops imitate the timbre of the sharp attack in bow instruments, bringing the *martellato* technique in “Sirens” to bear mostly upon the parameter of timbre, exactly as it happens in music. As seen above, in *A Portrait* vowels or consonants timbre were sometimes used to imitate sounds – which are often real sounds (e.g. when Stephen compares the noise of the train to the noise in the refectory, or when he considers the sound of the word “suck” [*P*: 9]). The properties of the language and the capacity of the language to imitate real sounds seem to be initially used to show the poetical discoveries of young Stephen, and then fully developed when Joyce tries to imitate musical sounds and techniques in the 11th episode of *Ulysses.*
5 Conclusions

As briefly shown, the stylistic expedients used in the prose of the first chapter of *A Portrait* can have analogous correspondents in the rhythmical and acoustical devices used in musical compositions; the ‘linguistic musicality’ that several scholars have claimed to be present in Joyce’s texts – what Rice and Fischer term “verbal music” (Rice 1999; Fischer 1999) or “melos” as per Waver (Weaver 1998) – could thus be considered more than just a metaphor. Verbal rhyme patterns (consonant repetitions, words and phrases patterns, and even the recurrence of sentences) characterise both the micro and the macro-level of Joyce’s literary discourse, just as rhythmical patterns and melodic clusters recur in the micro and macro level of musical compositions. Considering the parameters of sounds, which have in the organisation of the “secondary rhythm” (Lanier 1880) both music and language, some comparisons between their role in Joyce’s *A Portrait* and in music could be attempted.

Given the importance of repeated patterns of words and phrases in the text, the sound parameter of duration seems to play a remarkable role in establishing the ‘secondary rhythm’ of several passages of Stephen’s poetical pseudo-stream-consciousness. Similarly, in music, duration is among the most relevant sound parameters since the time length of notes is the most recognisable feature of musical themes, and recurring rhythmic patterns are important in the structure of all musical compositions. Timbre devices (such as alliteration and internal rhymes) are among the second most used musical expedients in Joyce’s text. Unlike in music itself – where timbre is often a mere colouristic expedient (e.g. the sound of a violin proves sweeter than the sound of a trumpet and hence can be preferred for certain motifs), while the substance of the composition is given by melodies with different pitches – in *A Portrait* timbre plays a more significant role than pitch does. A few melodic expedients are also present in the text. Although less used in *A Portrait* than in “Sirens”, the different pitches of intonation units help the reader in identifying the voices quoted in the narrative – through what Bakhtin terms “intonational quotation marks” (Bakhtin 1981, 50) – and understanding some of the character’s thought associations. Concerning the different role of intonation in music and in Joyce’s texts, it is interesting to note that while in *A Portrait* the use of intonational quotations marks is not widespread, the quotation mechanism will become more and more complex in the interior monologue of the specifically musical episode of *Ulysses*, because self-quotations and repetitions of others’ words and expressions are typical of Bloom’s thinking processes and of his mental associations, and also characterise the narrator’s voice. This could show a more musically-balanced use of the parameters of sound in “Sirens”, in which pitch seems to be at least as relevant as timbre.
Another proof of the musicality of the style in the first chapter of *A Portrait* is the presence of the same musical devices in “Sirens”, which is explicitly written to imitate music. Although the features of the musicality of “Sirens” that have been considered here are only a few examples of the several musical characteristics of the episode, their connection with *A Portrait* shows that Joyce’s musical experiments with language started much earlier than during his writing of the 11th episode of *Ulysses*. Stephen’s attention to words in *A Portrait* and the *melos* that derives from it are echoed and expanded in the wordplays of “Sirens”; similarly, the mechanism of theme and variations identified by Weaver in the first text is repeated and developed in *Ulysses*. Furthermore, as stated above, intonation patterns that are sometimes used in *A Portrait* to represent different voices become an important stylistic feature of the narrative of “Sirens”. Finally, the peculiar punctuation devices found in short passages of *A Portrait* – *over* and *underpunctuation* – are also frequently used in the 11th episode, determining both a musical language and the musical technique of *staccato*.

To conclude, the examples provided in this paper, as well as others still to be found in *A Portrait* and “Sirens”, can possibly show how the simple rhythmical devices used by young Stephen in the pseudo-stream of consciousness may be considered the starting point of a more complex musical style, as simple musical themes and basic musical techniques could be expanded to create a sonata, a fugue or even a symphony. In this sense, “Sirens” could also be understood as a full development of the musical and poetic potentialities of the young artist shown in the first chapter of *A Portrait*.
Bibliography


List of abbreviations


Linguistic musicality. The University of Antwerp and the Royal Conservatoire jointly conducted an experimental study into the relationship between musicality and pronunciation skills (insertion and emphasis) in acquiring a foreign language. After all, research in foreign language acquisition suggests a connection between musicality and pronunciation skills. In the project they checked experimentally whether ‘feeling for rhythm and intonation’ - the essence of musicality - coincides with the processes responsible for pronunciation skills in a James Joyce’s Epiphany and Virginia Woolf’s Moment of Importance.

Bloomsday: James Joyce’s Ulysses Celebrated as Theatrical Event. Subvers o paródica do super homem nietzscheano em Momento Importante.

Irish writer James Joyce is a very polarizing figure. Some people love his wit, his wordplay, and his inventiveness. Other readers simply cannot stand his scholastic allusiveness. Indeed, if you are willing to undergo the struggle, Joyce’s books offer not only great wisdom but also great fun. Read on for a general overview of Joyce’s life and works so if you choose to pick one of his daunting books off of your local library’s shelves, you’ll be a bit better equipped to match minds with this literary master. James Joyce biography.

James Joyce portrait, via Wikimedia Commons. It is simply impossible to understand what’s going on in Joyce’s works without understanding his life. Perhaps this could be said about any author’s work, but it is especially so with Joyce.